[MS-0087.003.001.007]

CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT
ROCHESTER, NEW YORK

DIVISION OF
PLANNING AND RESEARCH

DECEMBER 1970

AN ABSTRACT OF A THREE YEAR LONGITUDINAL STUDY TO ASSESS THE FIFTEEN POINT PLAN

FIFTEEN POINT PLAN: PURPOSE

Two overriding goals characterized the Fifteen Point Plan, a plan approved by the Board of Education in early 1967. They were the reduction of racial isolation in the schools and the provision of quality integrated education for all children. Though not stated in these goals, but nonetheless a vital feature of the plan, was an experiment involving pupils in compensatory education as well.

The design formulated for evaluating the plan featured a longitudinal approach in which the effects of various school programs on pupil growth were assessed. The time span assigned for evaluating the plan was the three year period extending from September 1967 through June 1970. This article is an abstract of the comprehensive evaluation report completed by the District's Division of Planning and Research in the Fall of 1970.

PROGRAM ASSESSMENT

Three phases of the Fifteen Point Program were assessed and reported. They involved the scholastic growth of pupils who participated in the following classroom settings:

(1) *COMPENSATORY EDUCATION:* The reduction of class size (15-18 pupils per teacher and teacher aide) and the institution of compensatory services at School No. 3, a primary school having a virtually total black pupil enrollment

(2) *INTEGRATION-OUT:* The transfer of the School No. 3 intermediate grade (4-6) pupils to several receiving schools having exclusively white enrollees

(3) *INTEGRATION-IN and INTEGRATION-OUT:* The Expanded Open Enrollment Program at the "enriched" Experimental School No. 2 that brought white pupils into an inner city school setting and provided for inner city pupils to transfer voluntarily to outer city schools.

Comparisons were made between groups of pupils representing each of the above emphases. In addition, the scholastic growth of black pupils involved in these approaches was contrasted with that of similar black pupils enrolled in segregated classes (control classes). Moreover, the performance of white pupils was also included for certain comparisons.

PUPIL POPULATION

Overall, pupils enrolled at twenty-two elementary schools were involved in features of the Fifteen Point Plan. For program evaluation, however, the performance of pupils enrolled at only eleven schools was appraised in the data analysis. Although most of the pupils whose performance was assessed were black pupils, the scholastic growth of white pupils enrolled in the various classroom settings was also submitted to statistical analysis. Specifically, the performance of white pupils who transferred from their predominantly white neighborhood schools to attend classes at the inner city school were compared with their former school counterparts and, whenever feasible, with their new classmates.

For all groups, pupil mobility adversely affected sample size for each of the components analyzed. This became true during the third and final year when many of the original pupil participants had then shared in a variety or combination of educational experiences. Except for one grouping, only those pupils who had been involved for two or three consecutive years in their *compensatory*, *integrated*, or *segregated* classes were included. The lone exception delineates groups of pupils who had two years of segregated classroom experiences followed by a year of integrated experiences at the Experimental School; these groups are clearly identified in the report (Questions Seven and Eight).

PUPIL VARIABLES ASSESSED

For this study, scholastic growth was equated to three pupil variables. They were pupil achievement, measured by various standardized tests; pupil school attendance, expressed as the number of days students were absent from school from September through June; and teachers' perceptions of pupils' social growth and work habits. For the latter, the perceptions were translated to a numerical scale ("1" excellent to "5" poor). Both pupil attendance and teacher perceptions were recorded for each of the final two years covered in the study. However, pupil achievement for each group was viewed for the full two or three years of the treatment period and was assigned greater value than the other two variables in the data analysis. Tables showing the comparisons of pupils involved in the various approaches are presented in the Appendix of the Final Report.

STATISTICAL METHODS AND PROCEDURES

If groups being compared appeared to be similar on pretest reading measures, t-tests were computed for the statistical analyses. When there was not a satisfactory pretest match, a one-way analysis of covariance was substituted. These statistical procedures were used to help provide answers to the nine research questions raised in the study. Moreover, the .05 level of confidence was established as acceptable for determining the significance for any one analysis.

All standardized posttests for pupils in Grades 2 through 6 were administered in May 1970. Pupils involved for three years were pretested near the beginning of the 1967-68 school year while the two year participants were given pretests in early October 1968. (Amplification of the statistical procedures and the listing of standardized instruments are presented in the Final Report.)

FINDINGS

1. Black pupils enrolled in *segregated* classes at the school having enriched emphases were not appreciably different in their scholastic performance from similar pupils enrolled in *segregated* classes at control schools.

2. Black pupils enrolled in *compensatory* classes achieved greater scholastic gains than black pupils in *segregated* classes.

3. Black pupils in *integrated* classes tended to show greater achievement gains than black pupils in *segregated* classes.

4. Black pupils in *compensatory* classes achieved as well as black pupils in *integrated* classes.

5. As revealed in the New York State Pupil Evaluation Program results, pupils in *compensatory* classes were the only students of those assessed in the Fifteen Point Program who recorded gains in their mean percentile standing during the first two grades of school.

6. Black pupils enrolled in *integrated* classes at their neighborhood school were not appreciably different in their performance than similar pupils attending classes in outer city schools.

7. There were no appreciable differences in outcomes between white pupils enrolled at an inner city school and white pupils attending their neighborhood schools.

8. Black pupils and white pupils who scored similarly on pretest measures and who attended *integrated* classes tended to have similar outcomes three years later.

9. Black pupils *integrated* at the primary level (Grades K-3) tended to show relatively higher scholastic gains than those black pupils who became *integrated* at the intermediate level (Grades 4-6).

10. Pupils having stability in residency reflected higher achievement outcomes in data obtained from the New York State Pupil Evaluation Program.

11. Black pupils attending *segregated* classes fared least well on the measures used for assessing pupils enrolled in the various components of the Fifteen Point Program.

12. Children who attended schools located in their neighborhood recorded fewer days of absenteeism than those enrolled in schools outside of their residential district.

CAUTIONS

Longitudinal studies of this type are affected by numerous uncontrollable program changes and design limitations. Among those affecting this study in particular were pupil mobility, teacher turnover, teacher differences, program differences, community pressures, and sample sizes. These factors must be kept in mind as the reader reflects upon the findings. While the effort has been made to describe and elaborate each more fully in the comprehensive report, it must be noted that the findings were relevant for a specific population, i.e. children enrolled in selected elementary schools of Rochester, New York during the three school years from September 1967 through June 1970.

NOTE: A copy of the *FINAL REPORT: A THREE YEAR LONGITUDINAL STUDY TO ASSESS A FIFTEEN POINT PLAN TO REDUCE RACIAL ISOLATION AND PROVIDE QUALITY INTEGRATED EDUCATION FOR ELEMENTARY SCHOOL PUPILS* is available through the Division of Planning and Research, City School District, 13 Fitzhugh Street S., Rochester, New York 14614